

Equity Exercise

Equity Exercise

Emma Frew, University of Birmingham

Session Learning Objectives:

- To gain an understanding of the concepts of the 'rule of rescue' and the fair innings argument.
- To have an opportunity to prioritise between groups of individuals where there is a potential conflict between the two concepts.

Background

You have been presented with two exercises that describe six groups of patients with respect to the following attributes:

- Past health (age) and quality of health experienced to date.
- Future years of health and future quality of health without treatment.

We would like you to imagine that you have been tasked with making a decision on which groups of patients should receive treatment.

Group Exercise 1

Please assume that with treatment all 6 groups of patients will get an additional 3 years in perfect health (i.e. 1.0). There are not enough resources to treat all six groups so as a group please decide on the following:

- Choose *one* group that will receive treatment;
- After you have chosen the one group that will receive treatment we would now like you to imagine that more resources are available. Please rank in order of preference from second to sixth, which groups of patients you would like to receive treatment.

Group Exercise 2

Please assume that with treatment all 6 groups of patients will get a 0.3 health benefit (e.g. going from 0.6 to 0.9) during their remaining 10 years. There are not enough resources to treat all six groups so, as a group, please decide on the following:

- Choose *one* group that will receive treatment;
- After you have chosen the one group that will receive treatment we would now like you to imagine that more resources are available. Please rank in order of preference from second to sixth, which groups of patients you would like to receive treatment.

As a group you must prepare your case for your choices for each exercise. Please nominate a spokesperson to present.

Length of presentation: 5 minutes (maximum)

Equity Exercise

Exercise 1

With treatment all groups will get an additional 3 years in 100% health.

	Years	Health
Past health	60	1.0
Future health without treatment	1	1.0

	Years	Health
Past health	40	1.0
Future health without treatment	6	1.0

	Years	Health
Past health	60	1.0
Future health without treatment	6	1.0

	Years	Health
Past health	60	0.5
Future health without treatment	6	1.0

	Years	Health
Past health	40	1.00
Future health without treatment	1	1.0

	Years	Health
Past health	60	0.5
Future health without treatment	1	1.0

Equity Exercise

Exercise 2

With treatment all groups will get a 0.3 benefit during their remaining 10 years

	Years	Health
Past health	60	1.0
Future health without treatment	10	0.6

	Years	Health
Past health	40	1.0
Future health without treatment	10	0.1

	Years	Health
Past health	40	1.0
Future health without treatment	10	0.6

	Years	Health
Past health	60	0.5
Future health without treatment	10	0.1

	Years	Health
Past health	60	1.0
Future health without treatment	10	0.1

	Years	Health
Past health	60	0.5
Future health without treatment	10	0.6